#### REPORT

# OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY 0302000 "NURSING" QUALIFICATIONS

0302054 "APPLIED BACHELOR OF NURSING"
OF WEST KAZAKHSTAN HIGHER MEDICAL COLLEGE LLP
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS OF
EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES IN MEDICAL AND PHARMACEUTICAL
SPECIALTIES OF TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL
EDUCATIONEDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME BY SPECIALTY

period of external expert evaluation: from 7 to 9 April 2021

#### 1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 8 dated March 11, 2021, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct external evaluation procedures within the framework of institutional and specialized accreditation from April 07 to April 09, 2021 of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" (hereinafter referred to as the college) in the following composition:



Chairperson of the External Expert Commission
TOKBERGENOVA GULMIRA TELMANOVNA,
Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences, Honorary Worker of Education of
the Republic of Kazakhstan,
excellence in health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan,
Director of LLP "Higher Medical College "Interdent"
tel.: +77016557484, e-mail: tokberg enova@bk.ru.



Foreign expert

OLEINIKOVA TATIANA ANATOLIEVNA, Ph.D., Head of Education Quality Management Department Educational and methodical management, associate professor of the department

FME "Kursk State Medical University"

Tel.: + 7 (919) 272 22 74, e-mail: ol\_tanja@mail.ru



#### National academic expert

KUMAROVA ALTYNAI BALTABAYEVNA, Deputy Director for teaching and educational work SPE on REM "Taldykorgan Higher Medical College" tel .: +77058881798, e-mail: altynay kumarova@mail.ru



National academic expert

ABZHANOVA ZHANAR SOLTANOVNA, Deputy Director for Scientific and Methodological work LLP "Republican Higher Medical College"

tel .: +7 7475576783,

e-mail: z.abzhanova@mail.ru



National academic expert EVDOMASHCHENKO TAMARA VITALIEVNA, general practitioner, teacher of special disciplines MSE "Kostanay Higher Medical College" Health Department of Akimat of Kostanay region tel .: 8776 702 85 85,

e-mail: tamaradubina@mail.ru



Expert - employers' representative ESLYASHOVA DINA MURATOVNA, chief nurse SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 2", Uralsk Tel .: 87058112598,

e-mail: dina\_mirkiyasova@mail.ru



Expert - student representative BASEROV RUSLAN BEKTEMIROVICH, 4th year student in the specialty "Medical care" PI "Ural Medical College" Maksat "

Tel .: 8 776 2267153,

e-mail: basirov.ruslan@list.ru



**ECAQA Observer** 

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA,
Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department
"Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher
Education and Health Care".

tel .: +7 747 5609212, e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of the specialty 0302000 "Nursing", qualification 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" for compliance with the accreditation standards of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education (hereinafter - the Accreditation Standards), recommendations of the EEC for further improving the educational programme.

#### 2. General part of the final report of the EEC

# 2.1 Presentation of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" and the educational programme

West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College is one of the oldest educational institutions in the country. The history of the West Kazakhstan Medical College begins in 1916. At the end of 1916, the newspaper "Uralskiy Listok" published an announcement: "Zemskaya feldsher-obstetric school opens in the city of Uralsk on November 1, 1916, the course of training for feldshers - 3 years, for feldshers-obstetricians - 4 years. Scholarships are awarded for the best students".

On the instructions of the All-Russian Central Executive Committee on May 14, 1923, the Ural Feldsher-Obstetric School was transferred to the city of Orenburg, where it remained until 1929 and received the name of the "Kazakh Regional Medical College".

In 1929, the medical college was again transferred to the city of Uralsk.

Since 1954, the name of the paramedic and obstetric school has changed again, it was renamed into a medical school. This name survived until June 14, 1996. Since 1996, this educational institution has been called the "West Kazakhstan Medical College".

For more than a century of its existence, the educational institution has trained and graduated more than 23,000 mid-level medical workers in the following specialties: dentists, paramedics, midwives, children's nurses, sanitary paramedics, dental technicians, dental assistants, paramedics, laboratory assistants, nurses. More than 2,000 graduates received honors diplomas. Some of them received higher medical education, became scientists and heads of medical services and departments.

Other graduates successfully work in various medical and medical institutions in our country and abroad (Cuba, Germany, USA, Canada, Israel, etc.)

In various years, famous scientists worked - academician K. Zhumaliev, I.M. Malecha, Z.M. Rachmanin, F. Ya. Tripurov, A.A. Koblik, as well as doctors known in Kazakhstan - surgeon N.T. Alibaev, infectious disease specialist K.D. Tazhimanov, S.A. Lebedev, obstetrician-gynecologist I.I. Berlyand, S.P. psychiatrist Pisman, I.S. Edelzon, T.V. Cheusov, V.O. Miller, L.N. Anshakova and Dr.

There are many scientists among our graduates, whose names are known throughout Kazakhstan: Imasheva Rozaliya Galievna - Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Academician - a graduate of our educational institution, the first Kazakh woman, a child psychiatrist, worked at the Alma-Ata State Medical Institute.

Zhumatov Hamza Zhumatovich - Soviet virologist, Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, studied in 1929 at the Kazakh Regional Medical School.

Karakulov Ishanbai Karakulovich - studied at the Kazakh Regional Technical School in 1929 - 1931. - a famous Soviet epidemiologist, organizer of public health, a corresponding member of the Academy of Medical Sciences of the USSR, Kazakh SSR, Honored Scientist of the Kazakh SSR, Karakalpak SSR.

Tyurin Nikolai Alekseevich - in 1939 he entered the paramedic department of the Ural dental school. In August 1941, when he was 18, he went to the front. In 1952 he graduated from the Moscow Medical Institute, worked in Moscow at the Peoples' Friendship University named after Patrice Lumumba, was the dean of the medical faculty, doctor of medical sciences, academician.

The leaders of the educational institution were: G.I. Koltsov (1916-1920), A.V. Genke (1920-1922), V.S. Ponomarev (1922), I.V. Stepanov (1922-1923), M.A. Kutin (1923-1924), M.T. Batalov

(1924-1931), I.S. Zobnin (1931-1932), I.Z. Shnibekov (1932-1936), M. Sundetkaliev (1937-1938), E.A. Shipulin (1937-1938), M.G. Sokolov (1938-1940), P.A. Pryanin (1940-1941), R.S. Podolskaya (1941-1944), E.I. Shchelkov (1944-1954), N.T. Alibaev (1954-1960), A.V. Tikhonov (1960-1979), A.N. Ibatov (1979-1984), M.K. Bergen (1984-2012). They worked hard and left an indelible mark on the development of the regional health care sector and in the training of medical personnel. Since 2012, the college was headed by N. M. Shumbalov, candidate of medical sciences, associate professor of the Department of Social Hygiene and Health Organization, who for many years previously worked as head of the department, dean, vice-rector of the West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after M. Ospanov in Aktobe, "Excellence in Education", "Excellence in Health care of the RK"

Since 2018, the college has been headed by Irmenov Kamidolla Mutigollaevich, candidate of medical sciences, honorary professor of the NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU, who has been the head of health care in EKR for more than 10 years.

The legal address of the college: 090009, West Kazakhstan region, Uralsk, Zhangirkhana, 67. Phones: 8 (711) 2-24-31-34, email address<a href="https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/">https://www.zko-medcollege.kz/</a> Founder - EKR Health Department. The legal address of the founder: 090000, Uralsk, Dostyk avenue, house 201.

The college carries out educational activities in the specialty 0302000 "Nursing" qualification 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" on the basis of state license series No. KZ88LAA00007929, issued by the Department of Education Control of the West Kazakhstan region of the Committee for Control in Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 09.12.2016, valid for an indefinite period.

In 2014, the West Kazakhstan Medical College, among the six basic colleges of the Republic of Kazakhstan, was included in the implementation of the pilot project of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the implementation of *the Applied Bachelor's Educational Programme in the specialty "Nursing"*. This project was developed and is being implemented within the framework of the World Bank project "Technology Transfer and Institutional Reform in the Health care Sector of the Republic of Kazakhstan".

By the decision of the National Commission of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2016, the college received the status of the Higher Medical College. Since 2016, training has begun on an accelerated applied bachelor's programme with a training period of 1 year and 6 months.

At the time of the assessment, the contingent of students of applied bachelor's degree in the specialty "Nursing" was - 218 people, including them; according to the Republican budget - 69 people, the local budget - 25, on a contractual basis - 124 people.

Since 2018, the graduation of applied bachelors has been carried out in the amount of -230 people.

#### 2.2 Information on previous accreditation

the programme has not been accredited to date

# 2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational programme of the specialty 0302000 "Nursing", qualification 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College"

The self-assessment report of the educational programme of the applied bachelor's degree in the specialty "Nursing" is presented on 148 pages. The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness based on the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, and the internal consistency of information provided by the accredited college. Attached to the report is a cover letter signed by the director Kamidolla Mutigollaevich Irmenov, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report is characterized by the completeness of responses to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness based on the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, and the

internal consistency of information provided by the accredited college. Self-assessment of the college and the educational programme was carried out on the basis of the order on the formation of the composition of the internal self-assessment commission No. 735 dated 12/08/2020.

The self-assessment process was carried out collegially, based on the principles of openness, transparency and transparency. Responsible for institutional self-assessment is Almagambetova Gulmira Ibragimovna: Deputy Director for Academic Affairs. The reliability of the information in the report was confirmed by:

- 1.Zh.T. Isimova Head of the TCS "General Humanitarian and Social Disciplines"
- 2.M.T.Tarzhmanova head of the TCS "General professional disciplines"
- 3.V.P.Kurnoskina Head of the Department of Clinical Administration No. 1 "Special Clinical Disciplines"
- 4. N.V. Trunova Feduleeva Head of the Department of Clinical Administration No. 2 "Special Clinical Disciplines"

Thus, the self-assessment report of the college educational programme contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards.

The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards. Description of the key activities of the college fairly complete and updated software the number of students, teachers, administration, information on selection and admission, learning outcomes, knowledge and skills assessment results, material and technical base, contractual obligations with partners, financial information, plans for development and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of strengths and areas for improvement.

The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

#### 3. External expert evaluation

#### 3.1. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the institutional assessment of the college was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by the order of the Director General of the NEI "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Higher Education and Health care" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme external visit, approved on 08.01.2021 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Director General of the college Irmenov K.M.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the educational programme of the Applied Bachelor's degree, members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with students, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, online questioning of teachers and students in the period 6-09.04.2021, a review of resources in the context of fulfilling the standards of specialized accreditation, the study of college documents and teaching materials of educational programmes.

On the part of the college staff, the presence of all persons indicated in the visit programme and according to the lists of interview participants is ensured (Appendix 2).

Preliminary on 04/05/2021, a meeting of the commission was held, where distribution of responsibility by the chairperson of the EEC Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna was carried out among the members of the EEC; Self-assessment reports at a glance. Discussion of key issues, including the results of expert evaluation of self-assessment reports, familiarization of EEC members with recommendations for self-assessment reports; Discussion of the list of documents that must be

additionally requested from the college for the validation of self-assessment reports; Discussion of the programme and schedule of external expert evaluation; Planning the work of EEC members.

# The first day of the visit is 04/07/2021.

During the organizational meeting chaired by Tokbergenova Gulmira Telmanovna the programme of external expert evaluation has been clarified, the events of the first day of the visit are planned (photo 1).



Photo 1. Organizational meeting of the EEC

In accordance with the programme and schedule of external expert work, members of the EEC held a meeting and interview with the management of the college (photo 2). There was a presentation of the EEC members, familiarization with the goals of external expert assessment.



Photo 2. EEC conducts an interview with heads of departments

The interview questions related to the mission, strategic goal and directions of strategic development of the organization and the relationship of the mission with educational activities. Director Irmenov K.M. made a presentation about the college, which reflects the strategy, mission and vision, international cooperation with the JAMK University of Applied Sciences, Finland and with the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences (Kaunas), Russian Medical Universities (Saratov and Samara Medical University), 2 medical colleges such as the Samara Medical Lyapina College and Kazan Medical College, agreements with 41 bases for the practice of students of the city and the region, the institutional context of the college's achievements over 5 years and development prospects until 2022 (strategic plan), and also summarized the qualitative and quantitative characteristics of educational programmes for 7 accredited qualifications (5 specialties), while one of them (Applied Bachelor's degree graduated in 2021, 137 people (100% employment) out of a total number of 230 graduates) is accredited for the first time; employment information (100%). Demonstrated information about community service, employment of graduates, staff of teachers and resources for these programmes. The interview questions with the director of the college related to the mission and strategy of the college, financial stability and staffing, topical issues of interaction with the practical Health care sector, cooperation with clinical bases, compliance of the college's mission with the global goals of public health policy and the goals of accredited educational programmes, what funding for programmes by year, how the search and recruitment of teachers is carried out and what development programmes exist (School of the beginning teacher, internships), prospects for the further development of those educational programmes, which are most in demand and what activities are carried out according to those programmes that are of lesser interest to applicants. By the Director Irmenov K.M. comprehensive answers were given, the vision and key measures for the implementation of the development strategy were voiced, practical and scientific activities and how these tasks are integrated with educational activities for the preparation of students of applied bachelor's degree, taking into account the needs of practical health care and accredited EP for the first time. This interview validated accreditation standards 1.8 and 9.

Under the external expert evaluation programme, the EEC members met with the academic leadership of the college - Almagambetova Gulmira Ibragimovna, Shunaeva Bayanslu Kairmanovna, Temiralieva Nurly Amanovna, Mukhambetzhanova Asylzada Sapargalievna on the following issues: management of educational programmes, career guidance work, recruitment of students, statistical information on the admission and graduation of specialists.



The experts interviewed the chairperson of the 7 TCS and 4 heads of departments in the areas (Appendix 2) on issues: planning, expert evaluation, approval and implementation of programmes, programme evaluation, test and measurement tools for assessing knowledge, skills and abilities of students, academic counseling and student support, analysis of the effectiveness of training programmes. The functions and tasks of the TCS, their role in methodological work, research support of students, interaction with other departments is discussed. Questions were asked to determine how the mechanism for developing educational programmes is carried out, ensuring transparency of management in the college, participation of stakeholders in the planning and updating of educational programmes, frequency of updating, taking into account the needs of practical health care (annually), planning a meeting (work plan), keeping minutes meeting, on approaches to reviewing and approving educational programmes (external and internal reviews, employers' feedback), the experts got acquainted with the position and responsibilities of the chairperson of the TCS. Also, an interview was conducted with the deputy director for BP and the college psychologist - Kubieva Shynar Bekbulatovna, Aldabergenova Meyramgul Serikkalievna on educational and social work with students, support and counseling of students on personal issues; formation and development of communication skills, leadership; Events; projects; volunteer movement; feedback from students. 53 study groups have been formed in the college and 43 curators of groups have been appointed by the order of the college director.

According to the EEC programme, there was a meeting with representatives of the information support department - K.S. Gupranov, I.F.Kabiev, G.E. Kabdullina. During the conversation, the principles and methods of assessing students' knowledge were determined, the educational platform SmartNation was studied, loading training materials, an electronic journal on the platform, digital content of the platform, principles of replenishing the bank of test items for midterm control, intermediate certification in the test centre.

A meeting was held with representatives of support services: Gabaidullinov Yerzhan Ersainovich, head of the administrative and economic department, Akhmetova Arshagul Boranovna, chief accountant, Nurmukhambetova Asel Batyrgalievna, EP inspector. A conversation was held on

personnel policy, recruitment and recruitment of teachers, staff development, assessment and monitoring of college staff, teacher motivation.

In the afternoon there was a tour of the college: an overview of the material and technical resources (museum, dormitory, first-aid post, gym, assembly hall, simulation centre).

Training is conducted in 62 classrooms. A cabinet system has been introduced in the college, there are preclinical rooms according to the specifics of the EP. A simulation centre has been set up with rooms for injection, emergency care, communication demonstration and trauma care. Some auditoriums are equipped with interactive and software tools for the successful implementation of the EP, there are laptops, printers, scanners, photocopiers, video and audio equipment.

The college has an assembly hall, computer rooms, a library combined with a reading room. During the inspection of the library, it was revealed that the automated library system has not been introduced, which complicates the work of the library. Members of the EEC noted the low work of the medical office. The medical office has two rooms: for receiving patients and a procedure room, which are not equipped with the necessary drugs for first aid. The college has created 2 "WorkZone" for independent work of students, where access to the Internet is provided. During the inspection of the sports hall, it was noted that it was necessary to re-equip with sports equipment.

Interview conducted with teachers (on the zoom platform). Teachers answered questions from experts on satisfaction with college working conditions, material incentives, wages, and advanced training. The meeting participants demonstrated a fairly high commitment and loyalty to the college. They noted the interest of the leadership in the professional growth of teachers and their availability for them. Faculty members are familiar with the college's strategic objectives and goals

At the end of the day, the results of the external assessment were summed up, the results of the standards validation and the verification of the data of the self-assessment reports were discussed.

#### Second day of visit 08.04.2021

According to the work programme of the WLC, a visit to the college bases in the areas of training took place. We visited the city general hospital. A meeting was held with the head of the medical organization Myrzakhmetov A.Z. He is a 2002 graduate of the West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College. This clinical base has 2 training rooms. Have trained mentors for the Mentoring programme. 5 nurses graduated from the applied bachelor's degree in nursing. The head nurse Gulnar Amirkhanovna is also a college graduate, she studied in Finland on "Mentoring". The head nurse is satisfied with the quality of training of graduates of WKHMC.

We visited the regional multidisciplinary hospital. The head nurse Khairova Akmaral Kairatovna showed 4 classrooms. She invited 3 mentors / mentors for the interview. This medical organization employs 336 paramedical workers, of whom 41 have an academic baccalaureate degree, and 62 people have an applied baccalaureate degree. 3 nurses are certified by the National Mentoring Trainer, who in turn have trained 120 mentors. Chief Nurse A. Khairova annually participated in the final certification of graduates, in professional competitions as an expert, participated in the discussion of the working curricula of special disciplines in the specialty "Nursing".

EEC members attended a number of classes. On the educational programme "Nursing" practical classes were held in the following disciplines:

- "Nursing in therapy "on the topic: " Rheumatoid arthritis. Osteoarthritis ". Teacher Ermekova Aselim Bulekbaevna Group MI 33. The lesson was held in the preclinical office in an offline format. In a group 8 students (attendance 100%).
- "Nursing in obstetrics and gynecology "on the topic:" Examination of women according to the list of guaranteed volumes of free medical care. Precancerous diseases of the breast. Malignant and Benign Breast Tumors". Teacher Dyusenbaeva Aigerim Zhangeldievna. Group MI 35. The lesson was conducted in a preclinical room in an offline format. In a group 8 students (attendance 100%).

During the lessons, the teachers used innovative teaching methods, such as: group work, CLIL methodology. The teachers had all the necessary educational and methodological documentation: EMCD, CTP, a lesson plan, a journal of lessons, assessment sheets.

Visual inspection carried out material and technical base educational programmes: classroom fund, laboratories, classroom equipment, IT equipment, computer classes. During the inspection of the academic building, evidence was obtained of a sufficiently good material and technical base and the availability of the college with the necessary equipment. For example: 5 nursing technology rooms were examined: the Nursing Competence Centre room is equipped with an interactive panel with access to the Internet, the Nursing Basics room is equipped with the necessary resources to provide rehabilitation assistance to patients, the Nursing Technology room has a Nursing Post, and also the office is organized by "Nursing Technologies" according to the 3H system. In the office "Pediatric" there is a corner "IMCI" and a zone "Vaccination room". All offices have computers and printers.

Further studied documentation on educational programmes of the college: constituent documents. Regulations on the organization of the educational process, Regulations on subdivisions, job descriptions, strategic plan, annual plan and reports, Regulations on the pedagogical council and minutes of meetings, EMCD, working curriculum, syllabuses, didactic materials, regulations, work plans, reports, order on LEC, diploma works, internal and external reviews, etc.), office passports. They provided 23 textbooks compiled by teachers of the WKHMC, including 8 textbooks on applied bachelor's degree in nursing.

Meetings with students of the Applied Bachelor's degree programme in Nursing demonstrated a good corporate spirit. Based on the responses of the students, it was concluded that they are satisfied with the quality of training, the student support service. They are ready to recommend the college to applicants wishing to get a medical education, as they consider their college to be the best. It should be noted that, the college has formed a good reputation among employers. According to working curriculum, students undergo practical training in various medical organizations. Employers noted a fairly good theoretical and practical training of graduates. Examples were given when individual graduates were hired immediately after their internship. Employers' representatives, also noted about good knowledge of the information system by college graduates, which helps to fill in the electronic database of a medical organization in a timely manner. And also, employers proposed to provide for the possibility of organizing advanced training courses in narrow specializations for graduates of the educational programme "Nursing".

The second day ended with a discussion of the results of the day, an exchange of opinions on the results of meetings, attending classes, and a preliminary formulation of recommendations to the college.

#### **Third day of visit 09.04.2021**

A meeting of the members of the External Expert Commission on planning the 3rd day of the visit was held.

We attended the final conference of the students' search and research work (SRW). An international scientific and practical conference was held on the topic "Viral infection - the problem of the XXI century. COVID - 19", which was attended by 15 people, including 2 participants of the Kazan Medical College. This conference was attended by 8 students of the educational programme "Nursing".

I agree with the EEC programmes, listened to the speeches of Syzdykova Dina Musabekovna "On interaction with Kazakhstani universities and international cooperation (in the context of additional education and educational programmes)", as well as Alibayeva Gaukar Aushatovna "On the implementation of the educational programme of applied bachelor's degree in the specialty "Nursing".

Further, a meeting of members of the EEC took place on the results of an external assessment of the college for compliance with the standards of specialized accreditation for the educational

programme of applied bachelor's degree in the specialty "Nursing". A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC.

Members of the EEC carried out an assessment of the college's compliance according to the ECAQA's "Quality Profile and External Evaluation Criteria for an Applied Bachelor's Degree Educational Programme in Nursing" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards. The document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. The chairperson held a final open vote on college recommendations and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. At 17.00, the oral report of the EEC was presented to the college staff. The programme and schedule of the external expert evaluation of the EEC have been fully implemented. On the part of the college staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

#### 3.2 Results of the survey of key stakeholders

The ECAQA observer conducted an online survey of college students on the resource https://webanketa.com/ from April 7-9, 2021. In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 39 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with training and resources of the organization. The total number of students to whom the questionnaire was sent is 499. The total number of respondents is 499.

By specialties: "Medical Care" qualification "Feldsher" - 44.2%, qualification "Midwife" - 10.14%, "Hygiene and Epidemiology" - 23.91%, "Nursing" - 19.57 %, "Laboratory diagnostics" - 15 "Pharmacy" - 2.17%. Fully agree with the statement that they will recommend college as an organization of training - 86.23%, partially agree with this statement - 10.87%, disagree with the statement 0%, doubted the answer 2.9%. Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of students associated with studying in college - 86.96% of respondents strongly agree, 9.42% - partially, strongly disagree - 2.17%, the rest doubted the answer - 1.45%. According to 84.06% of respondents, programme managers and teachers constantly involve students in the work of advisory bodies, the rest answered differently (they do not involve - 2, 17%, I do not know anything about it - 9.42%, doubted the answer - 0.72%, sometimes 3.62%). Fully satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, college auditoriums 84.78% of respondents, partially satisfied 12.32%, not satisfied 0.72%, partially dissatisfied - 1.45% and doubted with the answer 0.72%.

The college has created conditions for students to rest and eat (recreation areas, benches on the territory, buffet) in between classes - 79.71% agree completely, the rest of the respondents are not satisfied to some extent. Office equipment (computers, laptops, printers) are available for students in classrooms and practice bases are fully available for 86.23% of students, partially for 7.25%, not available for the rest of the respondents. The majority (88.41%) answered that teachers provide students with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes. In the opinion of 87.68% in the college there is access to the participation of students in research work, 6.52% partially agreed with this, and the rest - 2.17% deny it. Fully and partially satisfaction with library resources 89.13% and 10.87%, respectively. The majority (91.3%) have access to electronic educational resources. The availability of medical services for a college student is characterized as sufficient by 89.86% of surveyed students. 89.86% are completely satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators and tutors, partially - 5.8%, are not satisfied in one way or another - 4.34%, 0% do not know their mentor / curator. College teachers and staff treat students with respect - 95.65% strongly agree. Most of the respondents (90.58%) know that the college has and is implementing social programmes to support students, and 9.42% have not heard and do not know about it. The college has a career counseling service for students know about this - 87.68% of respondents. Fully agree that the college has established a system of self-study of students / pupils 86.23%, partially agree - 10.87%, the rest of the respondents disagree (2.9%), or doubted the answer. 76.09% of the respondents assessed the organization of training at the practice bases as excellent, 15.22% as good, 2.9% as satisfactory, 2.17% as unsatisfactory, and a considerable percentage of respondents - 3.62% could not rate at all ... Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in

college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%). unsatisfactory - 2.17%, and a considerable percentage of the respondents - 3.62% - could not evaluate at all. Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%). unsatisfactory - 2.17%, and a considerable percentage of the respondents - 3.62% - could not evaluate at all. Approximately 84.06% of respondents answered that there is sufficient time in college for practical training (patient management and care, nursing rounds, work in laboratories, etc.), the rest or partially agreed with the answer (13.04%) either disagree (2.17%) or doubted the answer (0.73%).

More than 89.13% of the respondents are satisfied with the schedule of classes in the disciplines of the educational programme, partially - 7.97%, no - 2.9%. Fully and partially satisfied with the methods of assessing the knowledge and skills of students 85.51% and 14.49%, respectively. The content of the educational programme (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty fully meets the expectations of the majority - 89.86%, partially - 8.7%, no - 1.45%. In the classroom, teachers use active and interactive teaching methods regularly considered by 84.78% of respondents. Sometimes -12.32%, rarely - 0.73%, the remaining 2.17% either do not know what the question is about or doubted the answer. To the question: how often the teacher is late for the beginning of classes -92.03% of the respondents answered that there was no such thing, 7.25% answered that sometimes, I do not know what to answer - 0.72%. According to 92, After completing classes, 75% of the students surveyed, the teachers constantly provide feedback (listens to opinions, conduct mini-questionnaires, work on mistakes), and 3.62% write that "sometimes", 1.45% answered "rarely", 2, 18% answered never. Two-thirds of the respondents - 91.3% - stated that a college teacher (mentor, curator) is an example for a student as a professional doctor, a person (ethics, communication, appearance, speech), the rest or do not agree with this - (2, 17%), doubted the answer (1.45%) and 5.08% answered "not all teachers of this college".

There is a sufficient number of patients to carry out practical activities in the chosen specialty, according to the majority - 86.96%. 87.68% of respondents like to study at this college. Experienced personally negative attitude of teachers more than 87.68% of students answered "no", 7.97% answered "it happened deservedly", 2.17% "answered yes is not fair", 2.18% answered "no answer". They are satisfied that more than 88.41% of respondents study at this particular college, partially 8.7%, do not know how to answer 1.45, but about 1.44% are either disappointed or did not know how to answer. The college leadership is available to students, according to the majority of respondents - 98.55%.

To the question "Are you currently in a scientific circle or participate in a scientific project", 71.01% answered "yes", and 18.12% - "no", the rest are in search, plan to start or do not want to do research.

93.48% of the respondents are fully confident that college allows them to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty, but 1.45% are not sure about this, 4.35% cannot yet give an answer, 0.72% want to believe it, and 0% began to doubt. 90.58% are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching in the college, partially 7.97%, 1.45% answered no.

80.43% of respondents assessed the work of the external expert commission positively, 14.49% were satisfactory, 1.45% were unsatisfactory, 3.63% doubt the answer. According to 84.78% of respondents, the accreditation of college or educational programmes is necessary, at the same time, 5.8% did not know what kind of procedure it was, 5.07% answered no, 4.35% doubted the answer. Most of the respondents answered that at different stages of preparation for accreditation, teachers involved them in different activities.

**Conclusion:** The external expert commission of ECAQA determined that the college has a corporate culture and ethical behavior between all participants in the educational process, as well as a developed system of mentoring and consulting students on academic and personal issues. This leads

to a positive attitude of students to the place of study. At the same time, students are fully involved in the work of advisory bodies on the development of the mission, discussion of the educational programme and the educational process. High involvement of students in research work was noted. Positive feedback from social partners about the level of theoretical and practical preparedness of students during the period of industrial practice testifies to a fairly high level of quality of training in an educational institution.

**Areas for improvement:** it is recommended to continue to work on attracting students to develop research skills in specialized disciplines.

# An online survey of 60 teachers was conducted on 12-14.04.2021, the number of respondents was 60 (according to the staffing table - 60).

Pedagogical experience up to 5 years - 26.39%, from 5 to 10 years - 25%, over 10 years - 48.61%. 94.44% are satisfied with the organization of the educational process in college, 4.17% partially, 1.39% partially disagree. In college, ethics and subordination are considered by 90.28% of respondents, and 8.33% partially, partially disagree with 1.39%. Satisfied with the organization of labor and workplace in college, 88.89% of respondents are completely satisfied, 9.72% partially, 1.39% partially disagree. In the organization, there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teachers, 88.89% of respondents believe, and 11.11% - partially. In this educational organization, I have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research in the opinion of 88.89% of teachers. The wages are completely satisfied with 88.89%, in part with 11.12%. 94.44% of teachers are completely satisfied with the work of the personnel department and personnel policy, and partly - 5.56%. During the year 54.17% of the respondents improved their qualifications in their specialty, in the near future 41.67%. More than 77.78% of respondents characterize the microclimate in the team as satisfactory, 1.39% - unsatisfactory, 0% do not pay attention to it. 20.83% are satisfied with everything. 87.5% of respondents believe that in college there is an opportunity to be realized professionally.

Of the respondents, 88.89% believe that the students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, 11.11% of teachers partially agree.

When asked if the educational organization supports my participation in conferences (international, republican), 73.61% answered that travel expenses are paid, 4.17% - only travel expenses, 1.39% answered that they prefer self-financing, 2, 78% paid only the registration fee 11.11% did not contact the management about this, 6.94% did not give an answer.

Completely according to 97.22% of respondents that students have free access to patients at clinical sites and all conditions for improving their practical skills, 1.39% partially agree, 1.39% doubt the answer. For the theoretical part of the lesson, 80.56% of respondents spend up to 30% of the total time, and 11.11% of teachers spend 50% of the time, and 0% of respondents - about 70% of the time, almost 90% - 2.78%, no answer 5.55%, which changes the optimal balance of the organization of the educational process.

Fully satisfied with the level of prior training of students (residents) upon admission to training programmes 76.39% of respondents, partially - 23.61%. In response to the question about mentoring work, 5.56% wrote that they are mentors, 73.61% a curator, 8.33% a tutor, and 12.5% had no answer.

22.22% of the respondents are not involved in clinical work, and 61.11% believe that it is the optimal combination of teaching and clinical activities.

88.89% of respondents are aware that the college implements programmes of social support for teachers, 11.11% are not aware of this. The availability of the manual was assessed by 100% of the respondents. Teachers use different teaching methods.

This questionnaire is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the college's activities fully supported by 90.28% of respondents, and 8.33% partially, 1.39% did not answer.

**Conclusions:** the team has a corporate spirit and support from the management. The basic education of the entire teaching staff fully complies with the requirements for the content of student training, carried out in general, humanitarian, general professional, special disciplines and meets the goals, objectives and areas of educational activities of the college. Job descriptions of teaching staff correspond to the typical qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and persons equated to them. The teachers are satisfied with the working conditions and the organization of the educational process, at the same time it is necessary to complete special disciplines with qualified teachers, to strengthen the issues of professional development.

**Areas for improvement:** Continue work to strengthen the teaching staff with masters, bachelors of clinical disciplines.

#### 3.3 Conclusions of the EEC on external expert evaluation

As part of an external expert assessment of the educational programme in the specialty "Nursing" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards, members of the EEC were carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the educational activities of the college and the educational programme.

The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, interviews with management, employees of departments, study of documentation, during interviews with administrative workers, interviews with students, teachers, employers, and questionnaires of 499 students, 66 teachers was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to ensure the reliability and validation of the provided college information and supporting documents for compliance with the above-mentioned ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" described his best practice in adhering to accreditation standards, during an external expert evaluation by EEC members, in addition to the 20 documents previously reviewed, additionally requested 15 documents and videos on learning resources, which made it possible to identify the conformity of the activity educational organizations to the standards of accreditation of educational programmes of TVE...

Recommendations for improving performance in implementation of the educational programme in the specialty ""Nursing" LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College for compliance with Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management of the college.

On the last day of the visit, members of the EEC conducted an assessment of the compliance of the educational programme in the specialty "Nursing" according to the developed ECAQA "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme in the specialty "Nursing" for compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards". The above document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. No comments were made by the EEC members.

The program and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. From the side of the staff of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College, participation of all persons specified in the program is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the educational programmes in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, Guidelines for external evaluation of a medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources was organized. The Commission notes the high level of corporate culture of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College", the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

3. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

#### **Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES**

The expert commission received convincing data that WKHMC defined the mission of the educational programme and brings it to the attention of stakeholders and the health sector. The mission and vision of the educational programme is in line with the mission and vision of the medical college.

The stated mission contains goals and an educational strategy to prepare a competent specialist at the applied bachelor's level with an appropriate foundation for a further career in any field of health, capable of performing the functions of a specialist in accordance with the established requirements of the health sector, prepared to continue further education in an academic bachelor's degree in the specialty " Nursing ".

WKHMC determined the expected final learning outcomes corresponding to the level of the European Qualifications Framework, the National Qualifications Framework, professional standards and the requirements of the State Educational Institution of Higher Education of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for applied bachelor's degree in the specialty "Nursing" and contribute to the formation of established basic and professional competencies.

The college periodically revises the mission of the educational programme, goals and expected learning outcomes, taking into account international and national priorities for the development of nursing education at the applied baccalaureate level, professional standards and requirements of the Health care system, the needs and expectations of stakeholders and society.

College mission published college website on the https://www.zkomedcollege.kz/images/STRAT\_PLAN17-21.pdf... Availability of a Strategic College Development Plan for 2017-2021 (www.zko-medcollege.kz) The mission, goals and objectives of the college, which are part of the Development Strategy, were developed by a working group of heads of structural divisions, discussed and approved at a meeting of the Pedagogical Council (Minutes No. 3 2017).https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1ep1ZvpVM79RFof December 26, EsFJnslAePkpiqdAs9O?usp=sharing... The mission of the educational programme is discussed and communicated the students branch meetings. to https://drive.google.com/file/d/17sa89HMW\_dCENYR0mNEW0iBIjXWTdIsN/view?usp=sharing

For interested parties and the public, the mission of the college is published in the scientific and practical medical journal " Medical Journal of Akzhaysky district ".

https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1JSgIGwAYrZsT8XD1nqF7NzQ0hKQVDqd6?usp=sharing Supervisory Board Minutes No. 1 dated 28.03. 2019 Results of the assessment of knowledge and skills of NCNE graduates<a href="https://drive.google.com/file/d/1R1cNrJyz35yXf4qUywPIvXsxJiJU3-qA/view?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/file/d/1R1cNrJyz35yXf4qUywPIvXsxJiJU3-qA/view?usp=sharing</a>

#### **Strengths:**

- 1) The college developed, approved and published a mission, in the formation of which the administration, students and teachers were involved.
- 2) The mission of the college contains goals and an educational strategy in accordance with the requirements of state educational standards, the national TVE system, allowing to prepare a competent specialist in accordance with the goals of the educational programme.
- 3) The college's quality assurance policy reflects the link between teaching and teaching, taking into account local and national contexts.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 9 standards conform: completely -9, significantly 0, partially -0, do not meet - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No areas for improvement have been identified for this standard.

#### **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES**

The educational qualification programme 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" is developed in accordance with the mission, goals and expected end results of the graduate model in the relevant specialties and reflects the professional standards of post-secondary education, as well as the needs of practical health care and the expectations of society of the college carries out educational activities on the basis of a state license issued by the Department for Control in the Field of Education of the West Kazakhstan Region of the Committee for Control in the Field of Education and Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 03.30.2018 No. KZ79LAA00011389. The components of the educational programme (compulsory component and optional component), industrial (clinical) and professional / pre-graduate practice meet the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for applied bachelor's degree in technical and vocational education.

The college uses modern methods - innovative teaching technologies that contribute to the development of motivation for the desire to master knowledge, self-development, awakening interest in the future profession. Active teaching methods used in the learning process at the West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College: role-based teaching methods, preclinical imitation teaching, problem-situational learning, developing learning technologies, informational, personality-oriented methods, design method. Teachers are fluent in and use in practice "Case technologies", "Technologies for problem learning", CBL, TBL, PBL, RBL, CLIL, BOPPPS, QR-cod, SMART and others. Key assessment methods include: Multiple Choice Questions, Objective Structured Clinical Exam (OSCE), Oral Exam, Essay.

EEC made sure that the educational process is based on the principles of equality and non-admission of any kind of discrimination against students and teachers. The study of documents that reveal the content of curricula shows the presence in all educational programmes of disciplines that develop students' skills and abilities that form the moral and spiritual foundations of the individual, patriotism, tolerance, active citizenship, etc. This is also facilitated by optional classes, educational activities ...

The expert commission received convincing evidence during interviews with employers, as well as during visits to clinical sites, that WKHMC organizes industrial training and practice with appropriate attention to patient safety, including observing the actions performed by the student in the clinic and the students have early contact with real patients. including his gradual participation in the provision of care and assistance to the patient in accordance with the requirements of the educational programme.

The college has signed contracts with 41 medical organizations for clinical and undergraduate practice. College trainers trained 98 mentors from clinical bases, who are mentors (mentors), and they are directly responsible for the development and consolidation of knowledge by students acquired in the learning process, the acquisition of practical skills and mastery of professional competencies.

According to the organizational structure, the deputy directors for educational work and educational and production work, as well as the heads of the PCC, are responsible for the development and implementation of the EP. All decisions on the organization and content of the educational process are made at meetings of the College's Pedagogical Council, which is reflected in the minutes provided by the EEC. The same persons are responsible for the periodic revision of the content of the curricula and curricula of disciplines. It was found that in doing so they rely mainly on the regulatory documents of the authorized body.

Thus, the study of the self-assessment report, documents, interviews with stakeholders revealed full compliance with most of the criteria of the standard

#### **Strengths:**

1) All EP of the college are developed in strict accordance with the state educational standard and standard curricula, the work programmes of the disciplines are drawn up on the basis of standard work programmes, agreed with the mission of the college, the sectoral framework of qualifications.

- 2) The college has clearly defined structures and leaders who are responsible for the development and implementation of the EP.
- 3) The qualifications obtained after the end of the training process are explained to the students and determined according to the corresponding level of NQF and EQF.
- 4) EP of the college are implemented on the principles of equality, any forms of discrimination against students, teachers and employees are excluded.
- 5) In the course of training, students receive not only knowledge, skills and abilities related to future professional activities, but also developing their personality, the basics of moral and spiritual development

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 19 standards conform: completely 15, significantly -4, partially -0, do not meet - 0.

Standard 2: completed

# Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Systematize educational planning documentation for dual education.
- 2) Develop a Regulation defining the procedure for the preparation, quality assessment, development and examination of educational programmes for social partners.

#### **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF STUDENTS**

The expert commission studied the system for assessing student achievement. It is based on VET regulatory documents. Evidence was obtained that the college uses effective internal assessment mechanisms to assess the basic and professional competencies of students. EEC members got acquainted with control and measuring materials, theoretical journals; selectively reviewed grade books and statements, class schedules, studied the methods and practices used by teachers to assess the achievements of students. We got evidence that the college attracts social partners (employers) to assess the professional competencies of students. The expert commission concluded that that the analyzed documents allow taking corrective measures to improve the educational level of students and educational programmes. The applied principles, methods and practice of assessing educational achievement are comparable to the methods of teaching and teaching and guarantee the achievement of the final results by the learners. The policy of assessing the educational achievements of students is based on transparency, objectivity and accessibility.

#### **Strengths:**

- 1) High satisfaction of students with the quality of educational services provided by the College
- 2) An independent examination has been introduced to assess the knowledge and skills of graduate students.
  - 3) Graduates demonstrate consistently high results of theoretical and practical knowledge.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria:* out of 5 standards conform: fully -4, significantly -1, partially -0, do not correspond to -0.

Standard 3: completed

### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Replenish and systematize the electronic database of test items in all disciplines

#### **Standard 4: STUDENTS**

EEC made sure that the college has defined and implemented a consistent and transparent admission policy for seven EPs. The regulation "On the college admission committee" was developed on the basis of the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated October 18, 2018 No. 578 "On the approval of the Standard rules for admission to training in educational organizations that implement educational programmes of technical and vocational education." The college accepts citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan who have basic secondary (basic general), general secondary (general secondary), technical and vocational education, foreign citizens and stateless persons in accordance with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July

27, 2007 No. 319-III "On education "(as amended on 04.07.2018 No. 171-VI).

In 2020, when admitting applicants, a questionnaire was used according to the methodology of A. Mehrabyan and N. Epstein "Scale of emotional response." The questionnaire contained questions that make it possible to study a person's feeling of emotional empathy, that is, the internal state, the emotional state of another person, the ability to empathize with people.

In 2020, admission to college based on general secondary education was carried out in an online format and enrollment was carried out according to the average score of the applicant's certificate.

The entrance exam for applicants entering the accelerated educational programme of applied bachelor's degree with a normative training period of 1.6 years in the specialty "Nursing" is carried out in the written form "Essay" to determine the critical and analytical thinking of the necessary competence in applied bachelors. The criterion for evaluating the essay was carried out according to the taxonomy - SOLO, as one of the examples of evaluating the cognitive activity of the applicant. The list of topics is published in advance in the journal "Medical Journal of Akzhaysky district" and on the college website.

Information on the results of enrollment is brought to the attention of applicants before August 31 of the calendar year by the admissions committee by posting on information stands and on the college's Internet resources.

The college adheres to the academic rules of transfer, restoration, provision of academic leave to students in accordance with the "Rules for the transfer and restoration of students by types of educational organization", approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated January 20, 2015 No. 19, by orders of the director of the college.

Academic counseling is carried out throughout the entire period of study, consultations are held on a schedule, teachers are available to students also outside the classroom.

The college has created conditions for the development of the creative and personal abilities of students. The college has circles, sports sections. A gym, a canteen, a first-aid post, a reading and assembly hall, and a library work to serve students. Students take part in the life of the college, make proposals for improving the educational process, take part in solving important issues of the college, are members of the Pedagogical Council. Students' proposals for improvement are considered at meetings of collegial bodies.

#### **Strengths:**

- 1) All student admission regulations are met.
- 2) A large and systematic educational work is being carried out. College students take an active part in the public life of the city and region
  - 3) Conditions have been created for the realization of creative potential and personal growth

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 13 standards conform: fully - 12, significantly - 1, partially -0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No areas for improvement have been identified for this standard.

## **Standard 5: TEACHERS**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the college has an effective system of motivation, stimulation of the activities of teachers and young teachers, advanced training of teaching staff and AMP. Personnel policy is aimed at increasing the continuous professional development of teachers and increasing the effectiveness of collective efforts to implement the mission and goals of the college. In the college, work is paid to train novice teachers in the basics of pedagogical skills, through the work of the SBT, mentoring, training in advanced courses both in the college environment and in other organizations of medical education in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad. At the time of self-assessment of the College's activities, the total number of PSs is 81, of which 57 are full-time teachers, or 70.5%, which meets the licensing requirements, presented to the

organization of education. Among working teachers, 1 candidates of sciences (1.7%), 14 masters (24.5%), 7 teachers (12.2%) have the highest category, 16 teachers (28%) the first and 22 (38.5%) the second category. Thus, the qualitative composition of the college is 74%. In general, the college is provided with qualified teaching staff. The personnel potential of the college owns modern pedagogical technologies and methods, forms a socio-cultural and health-saving environment, creates the conditions necessary for the comprehensive development and socialization of the personality of students, contributes to the development of the educational component of the educational process, broadcasts advanced experience, actively and creatively interacts with students, which makes it possible to effectively implement professional education programmes in accordance with the requirements of the qualification characteristics of the positions of teaching staff and the requirements for licensing educational activities. The college is working on individual planning and monitoring of teachers. The level of professional competence, methods, forms of professional development, qualifications and creative potential of members of the teaching staff correspond to the stated mission, goals and objectives of the strategic plan.

Teachers published in periodicals: international, republican, regional specialized journals and collections of 189 scientific articles, developed through the publishing houses "Evero", "Ακηυι" - 9 author's textbooks, held 25 open classes using innovative technologies.

Evidence: Personal files of teachers; Orders for the recruitment of teachers; Work plans and materials SBT; Personal data of teachers.

# **Strengths:**

- 1) Active participation of college teachers in the development and publication of analytical methodological scientific publishing activities;
- 2) Professional development of teachers and college staff in regional, republican, international courses and seminars;
- 3) Conditions for positive personal growth of teachers and opportunities for full disclosure of the potential for making a personal contribution of everyone to the sustainable development of the college;
  - 4) An effective system of material and moral incentives for the work of teachers and staff;

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 4 standards conform: completely -4, significantly -0, partially -0, do not meet - 0.

Standard 5: completed

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No areas for improvement have been identified for this standard.

# **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College has sufficient material and technical resources to conduct the educational process in the specialty "Nursing". Material and technical equipment, information equipment are constantly updated. The educational building of the college is located in a 4-storey typical building. The total area is -7890.9 sq. m, the study area is 5000 sq. m.

Classrooms are equipped with interactive whiteboards and LED screens, office equipment, a small and large (with a total area of 200 sq. m. For 300 seats) assembly halls, a sports hall with a total area of 421.1 sq. M., A library with a reading room for 80 seats. places. All study and auxiliary rooms are connected to the local Internet network.

Medical examination of students is carried out by the city polyclinic number 6 on a contractual basis. In addition, at college the medical centre is working. The expert commission revealed the lack of medicines for the provision of pre-medical care. The staffing of existing classrooms and laboratories according to the equipment tables for the whole college ranges from 65% to 95%.

There is a library on the 1st floor of the college. The library fund of the college is 37721 copies, including in the state language 13942, in a foreign language 43, fiction-4243, educational, educational and methodical literature 33326, in the state language 13616, electronic textbooks 152. There are 8 access points connected in the library: "Student Consultant" - 3 access points and

"Medical books" - 5 access points. The information system "Paragraph" is connected. The fund of publications in electronic media is 152 units, of which 54 are in the state language. A database of electronic books by discipline has been created in the electronic hall.

The college has a mini-printing house for independent work and publishing and printing activities. Furthermore, on the 1st floor of the college there is an educational and clinical centre, equipped with a new generation of mannequins. The department of advanced training of medical workers and the simulation centre operate on the basis of the UCC.

Since September 2020, the college has been operating a hostel of IP "Hayrekeshova" for 145 places for students from other regions and rural areas, where 5 students in the specialty "Nursing" live.

At the clinical bases of practice, 10 classrooms are organized: in the regional multidisciplinary hospital - 4 rooms, in the city multidisciplinary hospital - 2 rooms, in the regional perinatal centre - 1 room, in the city polyclinic No. 1-1 office, city polyclinic No. 5 - 1 office, 6-1 office of city polyclinic. The regional multidisciplinary hospital in Uralsk has 4 classrooms.

In connection with the pandemic, all students were transferred to distance education. For the organization of high-quality distance learning, the college acquired in 2020 and successfully operates in all specialties the educational portal AIS "College Smart Nation", developed by "InCraft" LLP, which replaced the Moodle platform.

West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College has defined and is implementing a policy of cooperation at the national and international levels with other educational organizations:

- with Medical Universities (JSC KazNMU named after S.D. Asfendiyarov, West Kazakhstan Marat Ospanov State Medical University, KazMUNO (Almaty) MUA Nur-Sultan),
  - with the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences (Kaunas) BN18-103,
- with the Carmel MedCurator Haifa, Israel on the topics: "Emergency medical care under international protocols."
- with JAMK University of Applied Sciences, Finland, on the development of nursing under the Finnish programme in terms of introducing an applied bachelor's degree, further promoting reforms in nursing in medical organizations, writing nursing guidelines within the Pro-In-Ca project.
  - with the Samara Medical College named after N. Lyapina

Work is carried out to support students outside the classroom, consultations are carried out, assistance is provided in participating in various regional, city, republican events.

#### **Strengths:**

- 1) The college has its own modern academic building.
- 2) Modern material and technical base.
- 3) Availability of information and multimedia technologies, the Internet for students and staff;
- 4) Wide coverage of clinical sites for internship.
- 5) Availability of our own training and clinical centre with a simulation centre

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 11 standards conform: completely -7, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Continue work on replenishing and updating the library fund in the state and Russian languages.
- 2) Supplement the library fund with electronic educational publications
- 3) Retrofit and update the material technical base with sports equipment and ICT.

#### **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the assessment of educational programmes is carried out on the basis of the academic performance and quality of knowledge of students, monitoring data on the satisfaction of students, teaching staff and employers, as well as the

achievements of students. Internal monitoring of the activities of the college and its divisions is carried out in accordance with internal regulations and is of a planned nature. The presented materials adequately reflect the criteria of this standard. Internal monitoring of the activities of the college and its divisions is carried out in accordance with internal regulations and is of a planned nature. Based on the results of the audit, the head of the audited unit develops corrective actions aimed at preventing the possibility of the occurrence of identified inconsistencies in the future. The college systematically studies the expectations and satisfaction of teachers, employees, employers, first-year and graduate students using sociological methods (questionnaires) according to the following criteria: organization of the educational process; the level of accessibility of educational and methodological literature; the level of accessibility to modern information technologies, satisfaction with equipping classrooms, laboratories with modern equipment, satisfaction with the recognition of success in educational, research and extracurricular (sports, cultural) activities, assessment of the moral and ethical atmosphere in college, quality of teaching and organization of the educational process; personal qualities of the teacher; the use of active and interactive teaching methods;

The results of the analysis of the questionnaires are communicated to the entire teaching staff, the college management for making managerial decisions and performing corrective actions. Relevant information and additional corrective actions are communicated to the students by the head of the department and curators of the groups. The results of academic performance (certification) for the semester, as well as the participation of students in the public life of the college are reflected in the individual rating of the student.

Evidence: Results of the analysis of the survey and the questionnaire of students; Minutes of the CMC meetings; Materials of pedagogical and methodological councils, materials of VKK; Materials of anonymous surveys of employers.

#### **Strengths:**

- 1) Systematic studies of expectations and satisfaction of teachers, employees, students, employers;
- 2) A high percentage of satisfaction of teachers, staff, students, employers with the conditions of work organization in the college;

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.** Out of 10 standards conform: completely -9, significantly -1, partially -, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

## Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Seek an opportunity, organize advanced training courses in narrow specialties for graduates of the educational programme

#### **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

The expert commission received convincing evidence that the current organizational structure of the college was developed in accordance with the mission, goals and objectives of the KRMC. The staff structure of the college management determines the composition of the divisions and the list of college positions. College units are formal groups of workers responsible for a specific set of functions. The qualifications of the heads of structural divisions correspond to the tasks of management. The base of internal and external regulatory legal acts regulates all the main processes. The management of the college is carried out according to the vertical and horizontal distribution of labor. The openness and availability of managers and administration for students, teachers and parents is demonstrated, responding promptly and resolving any questions that arise. The internal routine of the college is represented by a complete list of constituent, legislative documents, regulatory legal acts and instructive standards that determine the activities of an educational institution and TVE in general. The college demonstrates an efficient and stable funding mechanism, planning, accountability, openness and transparency in the allocation of budget funds on the principle of publicity. The sole executive body is the Director. collegial body Pedagogical Council. The College has an Educational and Methodological Department, Cyclic Methodological Commissions,

and a Centre for Youth Policy. In addition to the positions approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the positions of Deputy Director for Economic Affairs, Deputy Director for Crime Prevention, Head of the Industrial Practice Department have been introduced in the structure of the college,

#### **Strengths:**

- 1) Well-established management system corresponding to the Mission, goals and objectives;
- 2) Building College Management on the principles of a quality management system;
- 3) The qualifications of the heads of structural divisions correspond to the tasks of management.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 12 standards conform: completely -10, significantly -1, partially -1, do not correspond -0

Standard 8: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Organize work quality management systems to improve the management system for the main processes, unify documentation and record keeping.

#### **Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL**

The expert committee received convincing evidence that the college is continuously improving the quality of educational services provided. The goals of the college's strategic development plan are being updated taking into account changes in health care needs, new regulatory documents, and transformations in society. Planning is carried out based on the results of an analysis of the existing needs of the college, taking into account current activities, in accordance with previous experience and prospects for the future. The college regularly analyzes the activities of the teaching staff, in order to eliminate deficiencies, as well as in the development of a strategy, quality policy and revision of the organizational structure and functions. Resources are continuously allocated based on ongoing analyzes for continuous improvement. The teaching staff of the college, based on the results of constant monitoring and analysis of the educational process, identifying strengths, weaknesses, assessing threats and identifying opportunities for improvement, initiate procedures for a regular review and revision of the structure and functions for the coming year. If deficiencies are identified, the structural divisions develop a corrective action plan, and, if necessary, preventive actions.

#### Strengths:

- 1) The strategic plan for the development of the college has been updated taking into account the changing needs of health care.
- 2) The chosen policy and development priorities allow the college to take a leading position in the field of Health care and education in the West Kazakhstan region and successfully promote the goals and objectives of training specialists that meet the requirements of the labor market.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria.* Out of 4 standards conform: completely - 2, significantly - 2, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed

#### Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Seek funds for the purchase and implementation of an electronic catalog.
- 2) Introduce digitalization at the level of the educational and clinical centre.

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

# 5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of the specialty 0302000 "Nursing" 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" of LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College":

- 1. Continue updating the material and technical base of the college.
- 2 Constantly update the library fund of the college with modern educational literature in the state and Russian languages.
  - 3. Strengthen international cooperation in the field of medical care.
  - 4. To strengthen the scientific research work of students with efficiency in the form of publications and speeches
  - 5. To systematize educational planning documentation for dual education.
- 6. Expand the catalog of elective disciplines, taking into account the needs of practical health care.

#### 6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The EEC members came to a unanimous opinion to recommend the Accreditation Council to accredit educational programme in the specialty 0302000 "Nursing" qualification 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" LLP "West Kazakhstan Higher Medical College" for a period of 5 years.

Председатель Внешней экспертной комиссии	Токбергенова Гульмира Тельмановна	Hous
Зарубежный эксперт	Олейникова Татьяна Анатольевна	Other
Национальный академический эксперт	Кумарова Алтынай Балтабаевна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Абжанова Жанар Солтановна	Macef
Национальный академический эксперт	Евдомащенко Тамара Витальевна	Eff.
Эксперт– представитель здравоохранения	Есляшова Дина Муратовна	- Olgo-
Эксперт– представитель	Басеров Руслан Бектемирович	Bacepa .
студентов Наблюдатель от ЕЦА	Умарова Макпал Альдибековна	Ymy

#### **Attachment 1**

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational programme of the specialty 0302000 "Nursing", qualification 0302054 "Applied Bachelor of Nursing" for compliance with the accreditation standards of educational programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties of technical and vocational education

			Evaluation			
Standard	Criteria for evaluation  Number of standards = BS * / SU		Totally coincides	Significantly corresponds	Partially compliant	Does not match
1.	MISSION AND END OUTCOMES	9 = 9BS 0SU	9	0	0	0
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES	19 = 15BS 4SU	15	4	0	0
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES	5 = 2BS 3SU	4	1	0	0
4.	TRAINEES	13 = 8BS 5SU	12	1	0	0
5.	TRAINERS	4 = 2BS 2SU	4	0	0	0
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	11 = 8BS 3SU	7	4	0	0
7.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION	10 = 6BS 4SU	9	1	0	0
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	12 = 6BS 6SU	10	1	1	0
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	4 = 1BS 3SU	2	2	0	0
	Total:	87 = 57BS 30SU	72	14	1	0

# Attachment 2 Information about the number and category of participants in meetings, interviews, interviews with members of the EEC (full lists are in the accreditation centre)

List of documents requested by EEC members during the period of external expert evaluation

N	Names of documents	number	Date approved
3)	EMCD by discipline	4	February 3, 2021
4)	Contracts with clinical practice bases	8	No. 36 01.02.2021 No. 6 10.04.02018 No. 6 01.02.2021 No. 4 10.04.02018 No. 3 01.02.2021 No. 1 02/01/2021 No. 3 10.04.02018 g No. 1 04/10/2018
5)	Catalog of elective disciplines for the 2020-2021 academic year	1	09/02/2020
6)	IEP of student	1	09/01/2020
7)	Catalog: Checklists for assessing practical skills in interim assessments.	1	No. 3 January 2019
8)	Circle plans (SRW) of clinical disciplines and work	4	09/01/2020 09/05/2020
9)	List of students of the programmes of the specialty "General Medicine" participating in the SRW for the 2020-2021 academic year (diplomas, diplomas, certificates)	1	
10)	Works of methodical exhibitions of teachers	7	23.11.2018 05.10.2019 09/10/2020 03.03.2019 05.10.2019 05.11.2020 02/03/2021
11)	Provision of literature in the specialty "General Medicine"	1	Signed by the head of the library.
12)	Application for 2020-2021 academic year for equipping offices	1	Signed by the head of the TCS
13)	The work plan of the TCS for the 2020-2021 academic year.	1	03.09.2020
14)	TCS jamming protocol for the 2020-2021 academic year.	1	03.09.2020
15)	Schedule of additional classes and consultations	2	03.09.2020
16)	Personal file of the teacher of special disciplines	1	
17)	Student satisfaction questionnaire at MTB	1	09/10/2019
18)	Graduates Satisfaction Questionnaire	2	09/10/2019
19)	Individual teacher plan	4	09/05/2020
20)	Practice work programmes	4	09/05/2020
21)	Diary-report on the passage of the student's PP	1	00/40/2020
22)	Employer survey	1	09/10/2020
23)	The plan of educational work of the curators of the	2	03.09.2020

**Attachment 3** 

	department "general medicine"		
24)	Dual education contracts	3	No 105 in
			12/29/2018
			No. 131 10/14/2019
			No. 23A
			01/17/2020.